

## Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL POSS DUPE

PAGE 01 ISLAMA 02049 01 OF 04 281138Z

43

ACTION NEA-12

INFO OCT-01 EUR-25 EA-11 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-07 H-03

INR-10 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-10 PA-04 RSC-01 PRS-01 SPC-03

SS-20 USIA-15 SAM-01 IO-14 AID-20 SAB-01 SAJ-01

SCCT-02 EB-11 COME-00 TRSE-00 DRC-01 AF-10 AGR-20

FEA-02 INT-08 /217 W

----- 065809

R 281045Z FEB 74

FM AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 3541

INFO AMCONSUL KARACHI

AMCONSUL LAHORE UNN

AMEMBASSY KABUL

AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI

AMEMBASSY TEHRAN

AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

AMEMBASSY DACCA

CINCPAC FOR POLAD

AMCONSUL HONG KONG

USLO PEKING

AMEMBASSY LONDON

AMEMBASSY COLOMBO UNN

AMEMBASSY KATHMANDU UNN

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 4 ISLAMABAD 2049

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: PINT, PK

SUBJ: PAKISTAN INTERNAL POLITICAL ASSESSMENT

THIS MESSAGE CONTAINS AN EMBASSY ASSESSMENT OF THE INTERNAL  
SITUATION IN PAKISTAN, PREPARED WITH CONTRIBUTIONS  
FROM CONSULAR POSTS. ASSESSMENTS OF DEVELOPMENTS IN EACH OF  
THE FOUR PROVINCES OF PAKISTAN, PREPARED BY THE CONSULATES,  
ARE BEING FORWARDED BY AIRGRAM. INPLICATIONS FOR THE INTERNAL  
CONFIDENTIAL  
CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ISLAMA 02049 01 OF 04 281138Z

POLITICAL SCENE OF THE LAHORE ISLAMIC SUMMIT WILL BE DISCUSSED  
IN SEPTTEL.

SUMMARY: POWER IN PAKISTAN RESIDES FIRMLY IN PRIME MINISTER BHUTTO, WHO PERSONALLY CONDUCTS MOST AFFAIRS OF STATE. HIS STYLE, ENERGY, AND MASTERY OF THE MECHANICS OF GOVERNMENT AND MANIPULATORY POLITICS HAVE EARNED HIM POPULARITY AS WELL AS POWER. HIS POLITICAL PARTY PLATFORM IS LARGELY IMPLEMENTED AFTER TWO YEARS OF INNOVATIONS MOSTLY IN THE ECONOMIC SPHERE. FUTURE DIRECTIONS OF HIS GOVERNMENT ARE UNCLEAR. FACED WITH A POSSIBLE ECONOMIC CRISIS, THERE APPEAR FEW CROWD-PLEASING DIVERSIONARY INITIATIVES READILY AVAILABLE TO BHUTTO WHICH WILL CONTINUE TO GIVE HIS GOVERNMENT AN AURA OF DYNAMISM. CONCEIVABLY, HE MIGHT SEEK TO BRANDISH THE BANNER OF ISLAM IN ORDER TO COUNTER REGIONAL DISSATISFACTION WITHIN PAKISTAN, TO DISARM OTHER CRITICS AND TO RETAIN POPULAR ENTHUSIASM FOR HIS REGIME. IT SEEMS NOW UNLIKELY THAT ECONOMIC PROBLEMS WILL LEAD TO POLITICAL DIFFICULTIES FOR BHUTTO IN THE SHORT-TERM; BUT AFTER 1974 ECONOMIC DIFFICULTIES COULD BEGIN TO HAVE SIGNIFICANT POLITICAL REPERCUSSIONS. THE FRAGILE STRUCTURE OF THE PAKISTANI STATE DEPENDS TO A HAZARDOUS DEGREE ON THE CONTINUED DEMONSTRATED ABILITY AND ENERGY OF THE PRIME MINISTER. END SUMMARY.

1. ZULFIKAR ALI BHUTTO, EVEN MORE THAN HIS TWO IMMEDIATE MILITARY PREDECESSORS, CONDUCTS AFFAIRS OF STATE IN A VERY PERSONAL FASHION. HIS EXPERIENCE AS A CABINET MINISTER UNDER AYUB HAS GIVEN HIM A SEEMINGLY DEEP KNOWLEDGE OF THE INNER WORKINGS OF THE MACHINERY OF GOVERNMENT. PROBABLY MORE IMPORTANT IS HIS EVIDENT UNDERSTANDING OF THE POLITICAL DYNAMICS OF HIS COUNTRY. HIS ENERGY APPEARS BOUNDLESS, HIS MEMORY EXCEPTIONAL. HE HAS USED HIS POSITION AND SHILLS TO REINFORCE HIS PERSONAL CONTROL OVER HIS POLITICAL PARTY, THE GOVERNMENT BUREAUCRACY, AND TO A LESSER EXTENT OVER THE ARMED FORCES. HIS MARACH TOWARDS ONE-MAN GOVERNMENT PROBABLY STEMS IN LARGE PART FROM A VIEW THAT PAKISTAN, AT THIS STAGE IN ITS DEVELOPMENT, REQUIRES FIRM ARBITRARY RULE. IT ALSO REFLECTS WHAT APPEARS TO BE AN AUTHORITARIAN STREAK IN BHUTTO'S OWN MAKEUP, AS WELL AS THE FACT, RECOGNIZED EVEN BY THE  
CONFIDENTIAL  
CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 ISLAMA 02049 01 OF 04 281138Z

OPPOSITION, THAT THERE IS NO RIVAL EVEN REMOTELY IN A POSITION TO REPLACE HIM.

2. BHUTTO'S VERSION OF GUIDED DEMOCRACY, HOWEVER, HAS DIFFERED FROM THAT OF HIS MILITARY PREDECESSORS IN SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT WAYS: ACUTE SENSITIVITY TO PUBLIC OPINION; UTILIZATION OF PARLIAMENTARY INSTITUTIONS WITH MUCH LIP-SERVICE TO PARLIAMENTARY DEMOCRACY; AND POSSESSION OF A POLITICAL PARTY WITH A SOCIALIST-REFORMIST PLATFORM NOW LARGELY IMPLEMENTED. THOSE PAKISTANIS

OTHERWISE PERTURBED BY HIS INCREASINGLY DIRECT ONE-MAN RULE HAVE BEEN MOLLIFIED TO A DEGREE BY THE TRAPPINGS OF PARLIAMENTARY DEMOCRACY WHICH HAS HAS INSTALLED. THE MASSES HAVE RESPONDED WITH ENTHUSIASM TO BHUTTO'S POPULIST/SOCIALIST ECONOMIC PROGRAM AND TO HIS PERIODIC DISPLAYS OF SHOWMANSHIP. WHILE TANGIBLE BENEFITS OF HIS REGIME HAVE BEEN FEW, HE IS GIVEN CREDIT FOR TRYING AND FOR CARING ABOUT THE WELFARE OF THE MASSES, IN CONTRAST TO THE IMAGE CONVEYED BY HIS PREDECESSORS. BHUTTO HAS SUCCEEDED IN PRODUCING A SEEMINGLY VIABLE POLITICAL SYSTEM DURING THESE PAST TWO YEARS, ACCEPTED GRUDINGLY BY SOME AND STRONGLY SUPPORTED BY MANY. BUT IT IS A SYSTEM WHICH DEPENDS TO A LARGE MEASURE ON BHUTTO'S OWN POLITICAL PRESCIENCE AND PERSONALITY.

3. A WHOLLY POLITICAL BEING, BHUTTO HAS MOSTLY LEFT CONDUCT OF ECONOMIC AFFAIRS TO HIS ADVISERS (SEVERAL OF WHOM WERE APPARENTLY SELECTED FOR IDEOLOGICAL REASONS AND FOR REASONS OF PERSONAL LOYALTY RATHER THAN ECONOMIC ABILITY) WHILE HE CONCENTRATES ON CONSOLIDATION OF POWER DOMESTICALLY AND ON FOREIGN POLICY. IN DOMESTIC AFFAIRS, HE HAS INTERVENED FREQUENTLY IN PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS, PARTICULARLY IN BALUCHISTAN AND IN SIND PROVINCES. IN FOREIGN AFFAIRS, ALL BUT THE MOST TRIVIAL MATTERS PASS THROUGH HIS HANDS. THE NET RESULT HAS BEEN TO PROJECT PERSONAL DYNAMISM WHICH FLOWS OUT TO HIS PARTY AND HIS GOVERNMENT. IT IS UNCLEAR TO WHAT EXTENT BHUTTO HAS DELVED INTO MILITARY PLANNING AND MILITARY PERSONNEL ACTIONS BUT HIS ASCENDANCY OVER THE MILITARY SEEMS, AT THE MOMENT, ASSURED.

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 ISLAMA 02049 02 OF 04 281216Z

43

ACTION NEA-12

INFO OCT-01 EUR-25 EA-11 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-07 H-03

INR-10 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-10 PA-04 RSC-01 PRS-01 SPC-03

SS-20 USIA-15 SAM-01 IO-14 AID-20 SAB-01 SAJ-01

SCCT-02 EB-11 COME-00 TRSE-00 DRC-01 AF-10 AGR-20

FEA-02 INT-08 /217 W

----- 066001

R 281045Z FEB 74  
FM AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD  
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 3542  
INFO AMCONSUL KARACHI  
AMCONSUL LAHORE UNN  
AMEMBASSY KABUL  
AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI  
AMEMBASSY TEHRAN  
AMEMBASSY MOSCOW  
AMEMBASSY DACCA  
CINCPAC FOR POLAD  
AMCONSUL HONG KONG  
USLO PEKING  
AMEMBASSY LONDON  
AMEMBASSY COLOMBO UNN  
AMEMBASSY KATHMANDU UNN

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 4 ISLAMABAD 2049

4. VERITIES AND MANIPULATABLES: BHUTTO LEADS A PEOPLE  
IN MANY WAYS LITTLE CHANGED IN RECENT YEARS. AMONG THE  
RURAL MAJORITY IN A PREDOMINANTLY RURAL SOCIETY, CLAN,  
TRIBE, CASTE AND REGIONAL LOYALTIES AND RIVALRIES REMAIN  
THE FIRST CONSIDERATION. ONLY ON SUCH OCCASIONS AS  
THE PERIODIC PAST CONFLICTS WITH INDIA AND THE ISLAMIC  
SUMMIT CONFERENCE IS PAROCHIALISM MOMENTARILY TRANSFORMED  
INTO A SENSE OF BROADER IDENTITY. THE URBAN MIDDLE  
CLASS, PARTICULARLY THE GENERATION REACHING MATURITY  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ISLAMA 02049 02 OF 04 281216Z

AFTER PARTITION, APPEARS LESS WEDDED TO TRADITIONAL  
LOYALTIES BUT HIS STILL INFLUENCED BY THEM. APART FROM  
ASPIRATIONS TO EMULATE WESTERN PARLIAMENTARY DEMOCRACY  
ON THE PART OF THE EDUCATED CLASSES, MANY OF WHOM HAVE  
STUDIED IN EUROPE AND THE UNITED STATES, POLITICAL THINKING  
FOCUSES PRIMARILY ON PERSONALITIES. AN INDEPENDENT  
JUDICIARY, INHERITED FROM THE BRITISH, WAS ONE OF THE  
FEW POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS TO SURVIVE PAKISTAN'S EARLIER  
ABORTIVE EXPERIMENTS WITH DEMOCRACY. AS IN MANY EX-COLONIAL  
STATES, THE MILITARY SERVICES CONSTITUTE THE LARGEST AND  
MOST IMPORTANT INSTITUTIONALIZED FORCE IN THE COUNTRY.  
LOW-LEVEL CORRUPTION IS DEEPLY ENGRAINED AND ALL-PERVASIVE.  
PAKISTAN'S ECONOMIC RESOURCES ARE MODEST AND UNEVENLY  
DISTRIBUTED, ITS POPULATION IS EXPLODING AND BOTH  
AGRICULTURAL AND INDUSTRIAL PRODUCTIVITY IS LOW.

5. HAVING SACRIFICED AT SIMLA USE OF THE INDIAN "BOGEY"  
AS A MAJOR WEAPON IN DOMESTIC POLITICS, BHUTTO HAS  
RELIED ESSENTIALLY ON DIVIDE-AND-RULE AND ON COERCION AND

REWARDS TO CONSOLIDATE HIS POWER AND TO QUIETEN RESTIVE GROUPS. REFLECTING THE PREOCCUPATION OF HIS PEOPLES' PARTY MANIFESTO WITH OVERTURNING EXISTING STRUCTURES RATHER THAN CREATION OF NEW ONES, HE HAS ERODED THE POWER OF INDUSTRIALISTS, CIVIL SERVANTS, LANDLORDS AND THE JUDICIARY. HE HAS TAKEN FROM THE HAVES TO GIVE TO THE STATE, HAS STIRRED UP CLASS DIVISIONS AND HAS EXPLOITED REGIONAL SUSPICIONS AND PREJUDICES IN HIS EFFORTS TO DISCREDIT POLITICAL RIVALS. (INTERESTINGLY, ONLY THE POLITICIANS HAVE RESISTED STRONGLY.) THE MAIN POSITIVE NOTE HE HAS STRUCK IS A CONSISTENT PART OF HIS TACTICS: PERSONAL AND PEOPLES' IDENTIFICATION WITH THE UNDERPRIVILEGED MASSES.

6. ISLAMIC SOCIALISM AND THE PEOPLES' PARTY: AFTER TWO YEARS, ISLAMIC SOCIALISM, THE STATED GOAL OF BHUTTO'S GOVERNMENT, APPEARS TO MEAN LIP-SERVICE TO ISLAM AND PARTIAL, LARGELY AD HOC NATIONALIZATION OF INDUSTRIAL ENTERPRISES, TRANSPORT, DOMESTIC BANKS, PETROLEUM MARKETING, AND INSURANCE. (COTTON TEXTILES HAVE BEEN EXEMPTED BUT RUMORS ABOUND THAT TEXTILES, SUGAR AND PAPER WILL BE THE NEXT SECTORS NATIONALIZED.) WITH HIS CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 ISLAMA 02049 02 OF 04 281216Z

MANIFESTO OSTENSIBLY IMPLEMENTED IN LARGE PART, THE QUESTION ARISES AS TO WHERE BHUTTO AND HIS PARTY WILL GO FROM THIS POINT NOW THAT THE MOST EASILY ADOPTED AND DRAMATIC POLICIES HAVE BEEN PROCLAIMED. SOME INFORMED OBSERVERS HAVE SUGGESTED THAT THE NEXT FEW MONTHS/YEARS WILL SEE A HIATUS IN RADICAL INITIATIVES AS THE GOVERNMENT ATTEMPTS TO RUN ALREADY NATIONALIZED INDUSTRIES, GRAPPLES WITH ECONOMIC DIFFICULTIES AND IMPLEMENTS REFORMS AND INITIATIVES ALREADY ANNOUNCED. THE PEOPLES' PARTY, ON THE OTHER HAND, CANNOT REMAIN STATIC. BHUTTO HAS PROMISED A PARTY CONSTITUTION THIS SPRING, WITH THE FIRST-EVER PARTY ELECTIONS TO FOLLOW PATER. TIMETABLES SLIP, BUT THE STRAINS WITHIN THE PARTY APPEAR TO HAVE REACHED A STAGE WHERE SOME REALIGNMENTS ARE INEVITABLE. TROUBLES HAVE ARISEN, ESPECIALLY IN THE PUNJAB WHERE VARIOUS PARTY PERSONALITIES ARE COMPETING FOR POWER. BHUTTO HAS BEEN DISINCLINED TO PERMIT DEFECTIONS FROM HIS PARTY EXCEPT FOR A FEW LEFTIST EXTREMISTS, AND IS UNLIKELY TO PERMIT THE CURRENT INFLIGHTING IN PUNJAB TO END IN DEFECTIONS. THE POST-SUMMIT PERIOD, HOWEVER, WILL PROBABLY BRING SOME CABINET RE-SHUFFLING AT THE CENTER AND THE PROVINCES.

7. WHAT BHUTTO MAY HAVE IN MIND FOR THE PARTY OVER THE LONGER TERM IS STILL UNCLEAR. CONGEN LAHORE BELIEVES ECONOMIC DIFFICULTIES WILL LEAD THE PPP TO ADOPT AN

INCREASINGLY "LEFT" COLORATION. THE EMBASSY IS INCLINED TO THINK THAT IRRESPECTIVE OF ECONOMIC FACTORS, BHUTTO IS UNLIKELY TO EMBARK ON A RADICAL SOCIALIST COURSE, FOR EXAMPLE, IN AGRICULTURE; HIS POWER BASE IS STILL TO CLOSELY TIED TO LANDLORD AND OTHER CONSERVATIVE INTERESTS TO PERMIT HIM TO TAKE SUCH RISKS. HE MAY WELL, HOWEVER, INSTITUTE FURTHER NATIONALIZATIONS. HE WILL, OF COURSE, CONTINUE TO SEEK TO BUILD UP THE PARTY WHERE IT IS IN A MINORITY: IN BALUCHISTAN, THE FRONTIER, AND AZAD KASHMIR. DURING THE SHORT PERIOD HE HAS BEEN IN POWER, HE HAS ALREADY ESTABLISHED THE PARTY MECHANISM AS A CHANNEL THROUGH WHICH INDIVIDUAL CITIZENS CAN HAVE GRIEVANCES REDRESSED, BY-PASSING THE CONVENTIONAL GOVERNMENT BUREAUCRACY. (PATRONAGE, HOWEVER, STILL APPEARS TO BE FUNNELLED, AS CUSTOMARY, THROUGH GOVERNMENTAL RATHER

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 ISLAMA 02049 02 OF 04 281216Z

THAN PARTY MACHINERY.) HE HAS ALSO GIVEN THE PARTY AN IMAGE AS THE CHAMPION OF THE MASSES AGAINST THE "VESTED INTEREST," THE IDENTITY OF WHOM VARIES ACCORDING TO POLITICAL EXIGENCIES. THIS IMAGE MAY BE BLURRED SOMEWHAT BECAUSE OF RAMPANT CORRUPTION ON THE PART OF PPP OFFICE HOLDERS (WITH BHUTTO AND HIS FAMILY EXCEPTED).

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

MRN: 1974ISLAMA002049 SEGMENT NUMBER: 000003 ERROR READING TEXT INDEX  
FILE; TELEGRAM TEXT FOR THIS SEGMENT IS UNAVAILABLE  
MRN: 1974ISLAMA002049 SEGMENT NUMBER: 000004 EXPAND ERROR ENCOUNTERED;  
TELEGRAM TEXT FOR THIS SEGMENT IS UNAVAILABLE

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, ARMED FORCES, FOREIGN RELATIONS, POLITICAL SITUATION, POLITICAL PARTIES, CENTRAL GOVERNMENT  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 28 FEB 1974  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** golinofr  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1974ISLAMA02049  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** GS  
**Errors:** CORE1  
**Film Number:** n/a  
**From:** ISLAMABAD  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1974/newtext/t1974023/aaaaacpd.tel  
**Line Count:** 311  
**Locator:** ADS TEXT UNRETRIEVABLE  
**Office:** ACTION NEA  
**Original Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 6  
**Previous Channel Indicators:**  
**Previous Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** n/a  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** golinofr  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:** ANOMALY  
**Review Date:** 04 JUN 2002  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <04 JUN 2002 by boyleja>; APPROVED <14 JAN 2003 by golinofr>  
**Review Markings:**

Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
30 JUN 2005

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** PAKISTAN INTERNAL POLITICAL ASSESSMENT THIS MESSAGE CONTAINS AN EMBASSY ASSESSMENT OF THE INTERNAL  
**TAGS:** PINT, PK, (BHUTTO, ALI)  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 30 JUN 2005